



Impact assessment applied: two approaches one experience

Vanessa Quintero, Paris 3, PlaNNet Finance
Santiago Espinal, PlaNNet Finance Colombia

July 2010

Santiago Espinal

- Social impact assessment for MFIs
- Local experience: Coomostaza
- First phase of impact study: practical-experimental approach
- First results



Social impact assessment for MFIs

Most of the MFIs follows this logic:

If the clients comes back everything is ok...

But is the MFI really thinking on the welfare of its clients?

Usually they don't... They are more focused on the institutional performance

That means:

Impact Assessment in most MFI's has been conduced from a wrong approach

It has been confused with management assessments



Social impact assessment for MFIs

What means to assess the social impact of MF?

- Being able to present in a credible way that the services offered by an MFI have really influenced the observed changes, i.e. these changes occur because of the participation in that MFI.

What could be the social impact of MF?

- Improving quality of life of beneficiaries and reducing poverty
- Generating employment and prosperity for the HR of MFIs and ensuring their sustainability and growth.



Social impact assessment for MFIs

When an MFI wants to assess its social impact, it must first define with whom, how and when it will assess the Impact:

1. Who are the clients?
2. Are those clients benefiting from their participation on the program?
3. When & where impact occurs?
4. Are the products & services implemented by the program adapted to target clients?

Social impact assessment for MFIs

➤ **Then, MFIs have to define the levels where impact occur:**

- Clients
- Business
- Families & Homes
- Communities

➤ **The extent to which the changes identified are related to the participation of clients in the microfinance program.**

Social impact assessment for MFIs

- As the impact evaluation is expensive, meticulous and long, it is prudent to combine it with other tools: Market study analysis & monitoring of clients
- Demonstrate the impact of the program
- Improve the services of the program



Social impact assessment for MFIs

Secuencia de Evaluación de los Clientes

EVALUACIÓN DE IMPACTO

longitudinal, varios años
tamaños de muestra grandes
grupos de control
análisis complejo

Herramientas
de
SEEP-AIMS

INVESTIGACIÓN DEL MERCADO

evaluación rápida
retroalimentación del cliente
preferencias del cliente
toma de decisiones del cliente



Social impact assessment for MFIs

The impact assessment of the clients must be relevant in regard to what operators / funders want and need to know:

- *What is the impact of services on clients?*
- *How can we improve the program?*
- *Operators / funders want to assess the value of their participation, and also to improve the performance of their programs.*



Social impact assessment for MFIs

Following tools could be used to evaluate the impact of a program among its participants:

- *Impact Survey*
 - *Use of loans, utilities and savings over time*
 - *Empower customers*
 - *Customer satisfaction*
 - *Exit poll customers*
- *These tools should be adjusted according to the characteristics and objectives of the institution.*



Local experience: Coomostaza

Project:

Microfinance for the entrepreneurship of vulnerable and internal displaced women in Aguablanca District (Cali, Colombia)

Duration: March 2008 – June 2010

Financing: by EU (90%) & Carrefour Foundation (10%)

Amount: EUR 350.000

Operator: PlaNet Finance (Colombia)

Partner: Paz y Bien / Coop. COOMOSTAZA

Local partner: Alvaralice

Technical partner: Universidad del Valle



Strategy of the project

Microcredit

- *Diagnostic and Strategic Plan*
- *Technical assistance and transfer of technology*
- *Strengthening and follow-up of group credit strategy and sustainable financial planning*
- *Creation of a Business Services Unit*

Production & Commercialization

- *Identification of the best products + business plans*
- *Development of the value chain for the three best products: capacity building and technical support in accounting, quality and marketing*
- *Monitoring-adjustments*
- *Direct Marketing at CARREFOUR Colombia and presentation to potential local distributors*



Strategy of the project



Strengthening-Development



Microcredit funds + business service unit

RESULTS: 1500 women associated to the microcredit cooperative with technical assistance services for their micro businesses



Business unit + commercialized goods

RESULTS: 150 women working on the production of three products commercialized by CARREFOUR and other local distributors

Visibility/Empowerment

1. Local diffusion campaigns
2. Local Awards for the most successful women entrepreneurs.



Local experience: Coomostaza

SUMMARY

Products	Number of beneficiaries	Internal Displaced	%	Vulnerable	%
Generating income activities	412	252	61%	160	39%
Coaching - Commercialization	384	100	26%	284	74%
Technical assistance - Production	39	39	100%	0	0%
Training	122	65	53%	57	47%
Group Lending	250	11	4%	239	96%
Total	1207	467	38,69%	740	61,31%



Local experience: Coomostaza

Main difficulties of the program:

- *Weak diagnosis*
- *Low willingness of partners*
- *Poor human resources*
- *Paternalistic culture*
- *Poor human resources to ensure follow-up surveys.*
- *High mobility of population*
- *Distrust for the quantitative surveys*
- *Reduced resources to fund rigorous measurements tools impact assessment*



Local experience: Coomostaza

- An operational first phase of an impact study was implemented to measure the improvement of **entrepreneurial skills** and the impact on **income generation**
- The approach is experimental and to be complemented by the Impact study of Vanessa Quintero's PhD Thesis
- Study focused on different levels: **individual, business, households**
- Sample: 450 women among 1,500 beneficiaries
- Evaluation over time (Baseline: 06/2009 & then April-May 2010)
- There are not yet consolidated results



Local experience: Coomostaza

Modules:

General information for women entrepreneurs

Production Area : capacity, equipment and supplies

Marketing & sales Area: market knowledge

Finance Area: Accounting (balance sheet and EE.FF) and managed savings



Questionnaire

FORMATO DE VISITA

INFORMACION PERSONAL

- 1 Fecha Visita: 01/02/2010 2. Asesor: JULIANA JIMENEZ
- 3 Nombre de la Beneficiaria: ANA CECILIA CAMAYO Cedula de Ciudadania 29.568.533 de: JAMUNDI Edad: 45
- 6 Direccion: Cra 26 #108-46 Barrio: Manuela Estrato: 2 Comuna: 14
- 7 Telefono: fijo _____ Cel: 314 788 5421 Otro: _____
- 8 Nivel academico: (Marcar con X) Sin escolaridad () Primaria (1, 2, 3, 4, 5 x) Bachillerato (6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11) Tecnico / Tecnologo (12)
- 9 Tipo de poblacion: Desplazado Afrodescendiente ___ Indigena ___ Cabeza/Familia ___ Vulnerable: ___
Estado civil Soltera: ___ Casada: ___ Viuda: Union Libre: ___ Numero de personas a cargo: 3
Si es casada o Union libre Nombre del Conyuge: _____ Cedula de ciudadania: _____ de: _____
- 12 Tiene Seguridad Social: Si No ___ Que tipo: EPS ___ Sisben x
- 13 Ha recibido alguna capacitacion: Si x No ___

Institucion	Capacitacion
FUNDA EMPRESA	PROYECTO

- 14 Usted tiene empleo en este momento: Si ___ No Empresa: _____ Cargo: _____
- 14b Tiempo Laborando: _____ (Meses) Salario _____ Trabaja por: Horas ___ Dias ___ Semana ___ Meses ___
- 15 Cuanto suman sus gastos Familiares en el mes:

GASTOS	VALOR
Arriendo	180.000
Alimentacion	320.000
Servicios publicos	40.000
Parabolica	10000
Educacion	25.000
Transporte	
Recreacion	
TOTAL GASTOS	575.000



Questionnaire

INFORMACION GENERAL Y ADMINISTRATIVA

- 16 Nombre de la empresa: FRUTAS Y VERDURAS ANA Tiempo de Funcionamiento de la empresa ____ (Meses) Años 5
- 17 Descripción de la actividad: FRUTAS Y VERDURAS
- 18 La actividad que realiza requiere: Punto de venta sin local ____ Local ____ Ambulante X Hace cuanto se dedica a esta actividad: _____
- 19 Esta inscrita en: Rut ____ Industria y comercio ____ Camara y comercio ____ Ninguno X El negocio esta instalada en: Vivienda Independiente X
- 20 Funcion que cumple usted dentro de su empresa: Administrativa ____ Ventas ____ Produccion ____ Todas X
- 30 Cuanto suman los gastos de su empresa en el mes

Gastos	Valor
Servicios publicos	
Parabolica	
Arrendamiento	
Gas	
Transporte	\$ 120.000
Otros	\$ 60.000
Total Gastos	\$ 180.000

- 32 Como se ve con su empresa en el futuro: DISTRIBUYENDO A NEGOCIOS PEQUEÑOS

32a (El asesor debe determinar si el beneficiario tiene proyeccion) Si ____ No ____

33 Como se siente usted con la actividad que realiza: Excelente X Bien ____ Regular ____ Mal ____

34 Usted se ha asignado un sueldo en su negocio () Toma de las utilidades () (Marcar con una X) Cuanto: _____



The project: Coomostaza

42 sheets of impact assessment have been analyzed:

The best results:

- Marketing and sales
- Finance: business accounting and savings

The lowest results:

- Generation of revenues



Preliminary Conclusions

Some results

- Better ability to sell and better knowledge of the market
- Better management of business accounting: in **88%** of cases appears effective management of daily accounts from first to second period.
- Greater savings: it has a **32%** increase in average level of savings. It is a very important impact for households.
- No improvement in productivity or efficiency yet
- Revenues increased only in **13%** of the analyzed cases



Summary

Vanessa Quintero

- Thesis objective and context
- Internal Displaced Populations in Colombia
- Methodology of the research



Thesis objective and context

The main objective of the thesis is:

To assess how MF, as part of a program helping IDPs, can contribute to the socioeconomic inclusion of women in the frame of “Coomostaza” project.



Thesis objective and context

- **46 %** of IDPs households are led by a woman.
- Displaced families have an average of 5.2 children, and so heads of household have more difficulty providing for family members.
- **36 %** of the displaced population is under 18 years of age.
- **80%** of displaced people in Colombia come from rural areas.



Main displaced population in the world



Principales populations déplacées dans le monde

Source: International Displacement Monitoring Centre, septembre 2017
*Chiffres de l'IDMC, septembre 2017

Seuls les pays comptant plus de 300 000 déplacés internes sont indiqués. Les chiffres sont arrondis à la dizaine de mille supérieurs.



300 000 - 600 000

600 000 - 1 million

1 million - 1,5 million

1,5 million - 2 million

plus de 2 millions

What could be the role of microfinance among IDPs?

- Even if there is no evidence of success, some organizations aiming to assist IDPs are including a microfinance component among their activities.
- Recently, United Nations High Commission for Refugees signed a partnership with the Grameen Trust.



Methodology of the research

- 2 field studies (separated for about 8 months):
 - inter-temporal study
 - comparison over time
- Sample of 200 displaced women
- Information gathering: primary, secondary sources, questionnaire with quantitative & qualitative data, Interviews with various members of the project, Observation

Data analysis: SHPINX



Methodology of the research

What are the main dimensions of socioeconomic inclusion?

- Economic
- Professional
- Social
- Political

Relevance:
How changes observed in indicators can be related to the participation to the program?



Methodology of the research

Indicators that will be assessed:

Dimensions	Indicators
<u>Identification</u>	Name, Surname
	Age
	Place of birth
	Civil status
	Time spent in Cali
	Neighborhood
	Grade or diploma
	Seniority in the program
	Services you received



Methodology of the research

Economic

Employment status

Income stability

Loan use

Productivity

Savings

Social

Housing conditions

Child work & education

Access to Trainings

Social Network

Inclusion feeling

Health



Methodology of the research

Demographic

Location and patterns of displacement

Feeling of belonging to Cali (Aguablanca)

For each indicator it is crucial to :

- Verify the availability of information
- Show the relevance (link with the project)
- Test it with the first data collection

